Stevens, Rhys M. G.

2004

Canada’s Risky Business : a Canadian Guide to Selected Gambling Industry Sources

https://hdl.handle.net/10133/317

Downloaded from OPUS, University of Lethbridge Research Repository
Canada’s Risky Business: A Canadian Guide to Selected Gambling Industry Sources
By Rhys Stevens, University of Lethbridge & Maureen Beristain, University of Alberta

“The gambling known as business looks with austere disfavor upon the business known as gambling.” AMBROSE BIERCE, The Devil’s Dictionary (1906)

THE AUTHORS
Rhys Stevens is the Alberta Gaming Research Institute Librarian at the University of Lethbridge, Lethbridge, Alberta, Canada <rhys.stevens@uleth.ca>. Maureen Beristain is an Assistant Business Librarian at the Winspear Business Reference Library, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada <maureen.beristain@ualberta.ca>.

ABSTRACT
The rapid expansion of the Canadian gambling industry since 1969 has generated substantial profits for provincial governments and industry operators. As gambling expands its reach and regulatory structures evolve, a growing body of researchers is starting to scrutinize the industry and its socio-economic impacts on Canadians. This article provides background information on Canada’s gambling industry and presents an overview of essential information resources.

KEYWORDS
Gambling in Canada, Gambling industry, Gaming industry, Legalized gambling, Bibliographies

INTRODUCTION
For better or for worse, legalized gambling is operating on a scale unprecedented in Canada’s history. It has been observed that, “Canadians spend more on legal, government-promoted gambling than on clothing, shoes and medicine combined” (Hutchison, 1999). One of the gambling industry’s key strengths is its incredible ability to generate profits for governments. According to a recent Statistics Canada report, net gambling revenues rose from $2.7 billion in 1992 to $11.3 billion in 2002. Of this $11.3 billion, $6.0 billion was profit (Marshall, 2003). While some gamblers may undoubtedly win money, the biggest winners are clearly the industry operators – provincial governments, charities, and businesses.

As Canada’s gambling industry has expanded over the past several decades, gambling has been increasingly accepted by Canadians. Prevalence studies from several Canadian provinces reveal that between 81-86% of the population has gambled in the past year. According to experts, the leading motivations that Canadians cite for gambling are to win money, for entertainment, and to support worthy causes (Smith & Wynne, 2002). The primary motivation for playing particular games, however, varies dramatically (Azmier, 2001).
The remarkable expansion and acceptance of the industry has led scholars to speculate that gambling will emerge as a critical Canadian public policy issue in the coming years (Smith & Wynne, 2000). Libraries and librarians can play an important role by facilitating access to sources that allow an opportunity for furthering the understanding of this complex industry. This article will provide background information on Canada’s gambling industry and present an overview of essential information resources.

HISTORY AND REGULATION OF LEGALIZED GAMBLING IN CANADA
The history of gambling in Canada is inextricably linked to the Canadian Criminal Code, which in 1892 declared a complete ban on most gambling activities with the exception of horse racing. Gambling on horse races at the end of the century occurred both on and off the track. Although the legal status of on-track betting was uncertain, authorities were inclined to accommodate it (Canada West Foundation, 1999).

A 1969 Criminal Code amendment authorized provincial governments to manage and conduct lottery schemes and authorized charitable groups to do likewise under license. The federal government still had control, however, and conducted a lottery in the 1970s to fund the 1976 Montreal Olympics (Campbell & Smith, 1998). The provincial and territorial governments soon negotiated provisions that led to the introduction of further gambling options in Canada such as province-run ticket lotteries (e.g., Lotto 6/49, Super 7 Lottery). Governments began to generate substantial revenues from their virtual monopoly on Canadian gambling and became interested in diversifying their gambling offerings.

A major 1985 amendment to the Criminal Code permitted provincial governments to administer computer and video gaming devices (i.e., video lottery terminals, slot machines) and gave them exclusive control over gambling. Along with the expansion of electronic gambling, the amendment further solidified the provinces’ grip on gambling as charitable groups and First Nations bands were required to operate under their authority. Since that time, gambling in Canada has expanded rapidly and continues to evolve at a brisk pace.

Canada has a unique policy structure with respect to gambling. It differs from many international counterparts as gambling operates exclusively under the control of the provincial and territorial governments (Canada West Foundation, 2001). These governments work within the limitations of the Criminal Code to offer gambling options that the market and the political environment demand. Charities, First Nations and private operators also benefit from gambling in Canada by providing provincially authorized gambling activities through licensing arrangements.

LEGALIZED FORMS OF GAMBLING
Ticket lotteries, horse racing, and charitable gaming (including bingo) are currently legal in all ten provinces, Yukon Territory, Northwest Territories, and Nunavut Territory, but not offered in all jurisdictions. Casino-style gaming is available in all provinces with the exception of New Brunswick, Prince Edward Island, and Newfoundland & Labrador. Provincial electronic gaming policy in Canada makes a distinction between slot machines
and VLTs (video lottery terminals). Slot machines are usually found in casinos and at racetracks, and are available in all provinces with the exception of New Brunswick, Prince Edward Island, and Newfoundland & Labrador. VLTs are located in bars and lounges and are available in all provinces but Ontario and British Columbia. Internet gambling is not featured among the legalized gambling offerings in Canada.

Gambling formats such as video are far greater revenue-generators than others. For instance, Alberta Gaming estimates that VLTs will produce $603-million of revenue for the Alberta Lottery Fund versus $168-million from ticket lotteries (Alberta Gaming, 2003). Not all formats are exhibiting growth patterns. In fact, several (e.g., horse racing) have experienced a measurable decline in revenue. Others are reportedly in decline (e.g., bingo). However, due to a lack of historical record keeping by the provinces, not all trends can be confirmed by the available data (Azmier, 2001).

STUDYING THE GAMBLING INDUSTRY
As the principal operators and beneficiaries of the industry, provincial governments have recognized that legalized gambling is an immensely profitable enterprise (Campbell & Smith, 1998). Gambling revenue now accounts for a significant percentage of each province’s total revenues. Alberta is the province most dependent on gambling revenue, with 4.5% or an estimated $770 million of its 1999-2000 revenue coming from bets of one kind or another (Smith & Wynne, 2000). Governments are not alone in their recognition of gambling’s revenue-generating potential. First Nations, charities, sports teams, school parent associations, hospitals and even universities have turned towards gambling as a means of expanding programs or covering deficits (Azmier, 2001). A big chunk of industry profits are divided among commissions to retailers, expenses to management companies and the cost of operating provincial regulatory agencies (Azmier). Gambling operations also employ a significant number of Canadians. Sources estimate this number to be between 42,000 (Marshall, 2003) and 47,500 persons (Azmier).

The Canadian gambling industry is viewed as providing opportunities for economic development and financial recovery (Azmier, 2001). However, unlike the American, Australian, and New Zealand federal governments, the Canadian government has not undertaken a national study of the social and economic impacts of gambling in Canadian society (Smith & Wynne, 2000). As gambling expands its reach and its regulatory structures evolve, a growing body of researchers is starting to scrutinize the industry and its socio-economic impacts on Canadians. Themes that emerge from a literature review by Smith & Wynne (2000) include:

1. Much of the rationale for the expansion of legalized gambling, especially in North America in the late 1980’s and throughout the 1990’s, stems from the assumption that gambling revenues resulted in a net benefit to society.
2. There is a quest by some economists, methodologists, and gambling researchers for more appropriate conceptual frameworks, clearer definitions of costs and benefits, and more scientifically rigorous methods for measuring the socio-economic impacts of gambling.

3. There is a commitment in some countries to conducting national-level socio-economic impact assessments of gambling as an antecedent to public policy decisions relating to further gambling expansion.

There is recognition among provincial governments that the gambling industry needs to be examined in greater depth. The expansion of gaming activity in Canada has led to more organizations – government, non-government, private sector and academic – turning their attention toward gambling issues. As evidence, several research institutes have been provided “arms length” funding to devote to its study. Examples include the Alberta Gaming Research Institute, Responsible Gambling Council (Ontario), Problem Gambling Research Centre (Ontario), and International Centre for Youth Gambling Problems and High-Risk Behaviors (Quebec).

As gambling attracts the attention of more scholars, students, and community stakeholders, it is essential that they have access to academic, government, and other resources relating to this topic. The remainder of this article focuses on the identification and description of a core group of resources relating to the gaming industry in Canada. They include recommended databases, web resources, journals, books, and theses.

GAMBLING RESOURCES BY TYPE:

PROPRIETARY DATABASES
Proprietary or fee-based electronic databases are excellent sources of information on the Canadian gambling industry. The full-text of journal and newspaper articles, journal article citations, indexes to government document collections, and digitized historical materials are examples of resources that are generally found using databases. The following types of databases are recommended:

- DATABASES -- JOURNAL, MAGAZINE, AND NEWSPAPER ARTICLES
  Current journals, trade magazines, and newspapers are indexed, abstracted and often available in fulltext through the following databases: ABI Inform (business), Academic Search Premier (interdisciplinary), Business Source Premier, Canadian Newsstand (Canadian newspapers), CBCA Fulltext Reference (Canadian business), and Factiva (business).

  Search terms vary between databases but generally include the following: bingo, charitable gaming, compulsive gamblers, casinos, e-gambling, gamblers, gambling, horse racing, Indian casinos, Internet gambling, legalized gambling, lotteries, Native casinos, problem gamblers, problem gambling, and video lottery terminals (VLTs). Limit searches with the keywords Canada, Canadian, or the name of a province or
territory in the title, abstract or text of the article to focus on Canadian content.

- **DATABASE -- GOVERNMENT DOCUMENTS**
  
  *The Canadian Research Index (Microlog)* is a computerized indexing and abstracting service which includes citations to publications produced at all levels of government in Canada - federal, provincial and municipal from 1982 to present. The vast majority of gambling industry sources available pertain to documents produced by provincial regulatory bodies.

- **DATABASE -- HISTORICAL SOURCES**
  
  *Early Canadiana Online Full Text Collection (ECO)* is a digital library of Canada's printed heritage that features works published from the time of the first European settlers up to the early 20th Century. Keyword searches tend to yield the best results.

- **DATABASES -- COMPANY AND INDUSTRY INFORMATION**
  
  Surveys and reports can be located via *Factiva*, the *Financial Post Investor Suite* (Canadian), *Investext Select*, *SEDAR* (Canadian public company filings), and *Standard and Poor's Net Advantage*.

  National and provincial business directories are another source that will provide basic information including contacts and sales data for casinos and casino equipment suppliers. *The Alberta Business Directory: The Ultimate Sales and Credit Tool* provides a listing of casinos (SIC 7993-02) and wholesale suppliers (SIC 5099-39).

  The following table lists the Standard Industry Classification (SIC) and North American Industry Classification (NAICS) numbers that cover the industry.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table I. SIC and NAICS Gambling Industry Classification Codes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Standard Industry Classification (SIC) Numbers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7011 Casino hotels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7993 Card rooms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7993 Gambling establishments primarily operating coin-operated machines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7993 Gambling machines, coin-operated: operation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7993 Slot machines, operation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7999 Bingo parlors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7999 Gambling establishments not primarily operating coin-operated machines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7999 Gambling machines except coin-operated: operation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7999 Lottery clubs and ticket sales to individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7999 Lotteries, operation of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9311 Gambling control boards-government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9311 Lottery control boards-government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>North American Industry Classification (NAICS) Numbers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>713210 Casinos (except casino hotels)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>713210 Gambling cruises</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

  1 Although the Lodging & Gaming industry report focuses on the U.S. market, it includes a useful section on “How to Analyze a Lodging or Gaming Company.”
SIC and NAIC codes can be useful in identifying companies involved in specific gambling-related industries and in identifying their competitors.

WEB RESOURCES
Web sites are an increasingly popular way to distribute electronic versions of gambling industry publications. This trend is particularly evident in the dissemination of published research reports produced by industry and government (Stevens, 2002). The following web sites provide access to freely available reports and are recommended sources of industry information:

Alberta Gaming Research Institute
URL: http://www.abgaminginstitute.ualberta.ca

The Alberta Gaming Research Institute web site is a research “portal” for individuals interested in a wide variety of gambling issues. The Library Resources section of the site provides an extensive listing of on-line and print materials. Other areas of interest on the site include current and completed initiatives funded by the Institute in the Research section and a growing Gambling Literature Database (URL: http://gaming.uleth.ca) that contains over 650 industry-related gaming reports. The Institute is a consortium arrangement of the universities of Alberta, Calgary and Lethbridge. Its function is to support and promote research into gaming and gambling in Alberta.

Canada West Foundation
URL: http://www.cwf.ca

“Gambling in Canada: Triumph, Tragedy or Tradeoff?” was a three-year independent national study of gambling in Canada by the Canada West Foundation that ran from September 1998 to October 2001. It remains the only national study on gambling policy in Canada. Four overarching research areas were explored: (1) the impact of gambling on the non-profit sector; (2) opinions, attitudes and public policy implications of gambling; (3) the history and scope of gambling in Canada; and, (4) the socio-economic impact of gambling on communities.

Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC)
URL: http://www.hrdc-drhc.gc.ca

The HRDC web site contains a useful, though somewhat dated, profile of the Canadian gaming industry called “The Gaming Sector in Canada.” It includes an industry overview, a description of key gaming trends, and a number of occupational profiles.

Ontario Problem Gambling Research Centre
URL: http://www.gamblingresearch.org

The web site of the Ontario Problem Gambling Research Centre provides access to the interactive eWildman gambling bibliography. It describes, reviews, and cites close to 8,000 references on all aspects of gambling from an international perspective.
Responsible Gambling Council
URL: http://www.responsiblegambling.org

The mandate of the Responsible Gambling Council of Ontario is to help individuals and communities address gambling in a healthy and responsible way. The most impressive resource for industry researchers is the e-Library, a collection of over 5,000 gambling-related items (e.g., newspaper articles, online reports). This database can be searched by keyword, subject category and geographic location.

Statistics Canada
URL: http://www.statcan.ca/

Statistics Canada is one of the few organizations that publish data on the Canadian gambling industry. Industry analyst Katherine Marshall produces excellent gambling fact-sheets that are available periodically in the organization’s Perspectives on Labour and Income publication. Information contained in these brief updates is obtained from the Labour Force Survey, Survey of Household Spending, and National Accounts.

Provincial agencies that regulate and operate Canada’s gambling industries can also yield excellent information. Annual reports, research studies, and policy documents are the types of material generally found online. It should be pointed out that the names of provincial government departments that regulate gambling may periodically change and that documents may not always be available online.

KEY JOURNALS, MAGAZINES AND NEWSLETTERS
There are few serial publications that exclusively feature the Canadian gambling industry so the following titles should be considered as key information resources:


Canadian Gaming News is Canada's most widely circulated industry trade publication. Each month, editor Ivan Sack, takes an in-depth look at issues and developments which impact Canadian gaming in all 13 provinces and territories. Revenue, attendance and house-win statistics for each of Canada's commercial casinos is reported monthly.


The Research Reveals… newsletter provides updates on research activities sponsored by the Alberta Gaming Research Institute. This brief newsletter often highlights gambling research findings and their implications. Approximately one-third of the Institute’s research projects relate directly to the gambling industry.


The Responsible Gambling Council’s Newslink newsletter provides news, views and trends in gambling and problem gambling from around the world.

The major international and U.S. research journals titles are:

Gaming Law Review provides the latest developments in legislative, regulatory and judicial decisions affecting gaming at both the state and federal level in the U.S., and in more than 75 other countries. Coverage pertains to legal aspects of casino games, lotteries, sports books and horse racing.


The focus of this journal is on the hospitality and tourism industry, though many articles will be of relevance to individuals interested in gambling’s socio-economic impacts. It is especially useful for locating information related to casino management and operational issues. It is available in full-text from ABI/Inform (2000+) and Academic Search Premier (March 2002+).


As its name suggests, International Gambling Studies examines questions that are emerging as gambling expands its global reach. The journal’s content is quite varied and often attracts submissions related to gambling industry issues (e.g., casino marketing strategies). It is available in print and online by subscription from the Taylor & Francis website.


The Journal of Gambling Studies is the most well known scholarly publication in the field. Articles published in the journal are representative of a cross-section of disciplines including psychiatry, psychology, sociology, political science, criminology and social work.

A recent article by Awe, Keating, and Schwartz (2002) includes an annotated listing of additional periodical titles that cover U.S. and international gaming industry news.

CANADIAN BOOKS AND REPORTS

Many academic and public libraries in Canada tend to provide good access to print collections relevant to the gambling industry. Special libraries, however, contain the most complete collections of materials (e.g., Loto-Québec Documentation Centre, Centre for Addiction and Mental Health Library). The following items comprise a selection of recommended books and reports:


This report presents case studies on each province and territory with respect to legalized gaming regulation and control. It does so by examining the types of gaming operations permitted, the regulatory structure and administrative procedures in place to control them, and gaming data. Information found in this source can provide historical context for more recent data.

Bowal provides an annotated bibliography of relevant Canadian government and legal documents. Sections include federal government policy papers, provincial government policy papers (Alberta, British Columbia, Nova Scotia, and Ontario), Constitution Act interpretation, and cases from Common Law.


The contents of this volume represent a selection of papers and discussions presented at the Second National Symposium on Lotteries and Gambling. The conference brought together scholars, researchers, policy makers, gaming industry representatives, law enforcement authorities, elected officials, and representatives of charitable organizations.


This volume contains the published proceedings of the First National Symposium on Lotteries and Gambling. Sections include world gambling trends, the history and operations of regulatory bodies in selected Canadian provinces, law enforcement issues, research on gamblers and gambling, and a discussion of gambling’s costs and benefits.


Brian Hutchinson is a writer who toured Canada in 1998 and wrote about the people caught up in the country’s growing obsession with gambling. In this book, he presents an argument against gambling rather than an impartial report but he does so in a very compelling manner. A real strength of the book is his investigation of the backroom political maneuvering prior to the introduction of casino gambling that took place in Nova Scotia and British Columbia. The book provides an interesting overview of the state of gambling in each province and contentious issues relating to the government’s involvement in the industry.


*Chasing Lightning* attempts to provide a non-partisan investigation into Canada’s gambling business. The authors interview some of the key industry players and discuss the results of numerous studies from across North America. They provide a current overview, outline the business case, and offer insights into the responsible management of gambling. A jurisdictional survey follows, specifying per capita spending on gambling, provincial profits and the amount invested in problem cases.


*At Odds* is an historical examination of gambling in Canada from World War I to the federal legalization in 1969. Morton, an Associate Professor of History at McGill University, uses a variety of historical sources to trace the history of gambling regulation in the provinces of Nova
Scotia, Quebec, Ontario, Manitoba and British Columbia. She skillfully shows the relationship between gambling and the wider social mores of the time.


This literature review was commissioned by the Alberta Gaming Research Institute to identify scholarly articles in academic journals, texts, and conference proceedings pertaining to (1) the economics of gambling and, (2) public and private sector gambling policy and practice. Smith and Wynne provide an annotated bibliography and a summary report that discusses the identified literature.


This monograph examines three aspects of gambling in Canada since the introduction of lotteries in 1969: (1) the importance of government revenue from gambling in absolute terms, relative to various indicators, and from an international perspective; (2) the incidence of gambling, in terms of who gambles and how much they spend; and (3) the appropriateness of gambling, in terms of its costs and benefits to Canadian governments and to Canadian society at large.


The Whistler Symposium was held to discuss and debate various perspectives, definitions, and methods for assessing the social and economic impacts of gambling to society.

The following publications profile the North American gambling industry in general but also include information relevant to gambling in Canada:


The Almanac provides an in-depth look at the U.S. and Canadian gaming industry. It is an invaluable source of information for anyone examining the impact of gaming in North America although the Almanac is designed primarily as an investment tool. The Almanac covers the industry by geographic region. The section on Canada examines gaming in Ontario, Quebec and Nova Scotia. Each report includes a brief summary of provincial regulations, gaming revenues, a market assessment, market demographics, and a description of casino amenities.


Although it focuses on legalized gambling in the United States, this work by Hampshire College professor Robert Goodman is also relevant to Canada’s gambling industry. He presents a litany of facts to support his strong opposition to the industry. The book provides great rhetoric and good ammunition for gambling opponents. Recommended as a useful contribution to the debate.

This encyclopedia chronicles the history of gambling in the Western hemisphere from a scholarly perspective. Sections include biographical sketches of figures in the gambling industry, demographic and statistical data, full-text articles and summaries of major legal gambling cases, glossary, annotated bibliography, and reviews of books on gambling.


This reference publication profiles and analyses North American and international jurisdictions offering legalized gambling. Breakdowns by industry sector (e.g., lotteries, First Nations markets, slot machines, table games, legal sports betting, etc.) and future trends are also included.

**SELECTED CANADIAN THESES (1994-)**

The following theses contain original research on the Canadian gambling industry that has been produced to satisfy the requirements of an advanced academic degree.


Campbell argues that the form and substance of contemporary legal responses to gambling in Canada were shaped during the first twenty-five years of the twentieth century. It is apparent in the history studied in this dissertation that the regulation of gambling in Canada has undergone a transition from an activity formally illegal and prohibited at the turn of the century to an expanded, licensed, and regulated industry in the 1990s.


This dissertation discusses the impacts of casino gambling on an Ontario First Nations community with respect to self-government and economic self-sufficiency. Campbell recommends that other First Nations communities considering casino development be aware of impacts that casino-style gaming will inevitably bring.


This work examines the introduction of lotteries and casinos in U.S. states and Canadian provinces as a reaction to fiscal constraints. Hypotheses regarding the association of economic conditions with the patterns of lottery and casino adoptions are developed and examined.

In this dissertation, Fletcher surveyed the residents of Wells, British Columbia to determine their perceptions of how a casino would impact the quality of life in their community. The expectations of Wells residents were then compared to the experiences of other communities in which one or more casinos have opened.


This is a continuation of a baseline study by J. P. Lowrie (1994), which looked at property sales and their values within the neighbourhood of a planned casino site in downtown Windsor, Ontario.


In this dissertation, Little argues that the economic marginalization of Native Canadians has spurred many First Nations communities to pursue commercial gaming as a source of economic salvation. The legacy of gambling in Native culture is explored, as are the ethical dilemmas facing bands attempting to use gaming operations as a solution to fiscal ills.


This is a baseline study of property sales and their values within the neighbourhood of a planned casino site in downtown Windsor, Ontario. Three measurements of property alteration are analyzed: (1) the monthly numbers of residential and commercial property sales; (2) the sale prices of these properties; and (3) the identification of the purchasers.


This dissertation investigates the governing rationale of three provincially owned Ontario casinos. Mun examines general notions of benefit and cost that are implicitly understood within a political context of profitability.


A theoretical model of gambling behavior used to examine the relationships between regular gamblers, the gambling institution, and the outside society is proposed and assessed in this study. This model is based on findings from a participant observation study conducted in a Canadian urban casino, a review of the related literature, and interviews with regular casino players. The intent of this investigation is to explore the structural and cultural factors operating both in society at large and in a particular gambling institution.

This thesis explores the roles played by video lottery terminals (VLTs) in the lives of twenty-five regular gamblers living in a rural, fishery-dependent region of eastern Newfoundland. Reade suggests that the restructuring of social and economic life as a result of a fishery closure helped to create conditions in which playing VLTs assumed tremendous importance in the lives of certain area residents.


The process by which Native casino gambling policy was developed in Saskatchewan and Alberta between the years 1992 and 1996 is described and analyzed. Issues of native sovereignty, self-government and jurisdiction are examined with regard to their role in the policy process. It is argued that the Native casino gambling policy process unfolded due to the provincial governments' ideological systems of governance.
REFERENCES


Canada West Foundation (1999), *Canada's gambling regulatory patchwork: A handbook*, Canada West Foundation, Calgary, AB.


Smith, G. J. and Wynne, H. J. (2002), *Measuring gambling and problem gambling in Alberta using the Canadian problem gambling index*, Alberta Gaming Research Institute, Edmonton, AB.


NOTE: This document is a ‘post-print’ of a journal article that appeared in the peer-reviewed journal Reference Services Review. It was published in 2004 -- Volume 32, Number 3, pp. 320-328.

For more information about Reference Services Review, please see their web site at <http://www.emeraldinsight.com/rsr.htm>. 
